



Essential Skills in Demand Review

Example of a Submission Form

1. Background and contact information

1a) Who is this submission on behalf of?

Provide name of organisation

New Zealand Post Primary Teachers' Association (NZPPTA)

1b) Contact details

Include name, position, phone, email and postal addresses

T Haig
Deputy General Secretary
NZPPTA
PO Box 466, Wellington
thaig@ppta.org.nz
04 9134233

**Review of Essential Skills in Demand Lists
Submission Form**

1c) Disclosure

Please confirm that you have read and agree to the terms of the disclosure statement below.

Disclosure statement:

- The information contained in this submission, or some of its content, may be provided to others for the purpose of information sharing and /or consultation. If this is the case, personal contact details (individual names, telephone numbers and email addresses) will be treated in confidence.
- The information provided in this form is official information under the Official Information Act 1982 and, accordingly, the Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment may be required to release this information if a request is made under that Act.
- Occupational statistics collected during the course of the review may be used by the Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment for other research purposes, but individual employers will not be identified.

I have read and agree to the terms of this disclosure statement.

Name: T Haig

1d) Briefly describe the main activity and characteristics of the organisation making the submission

If a firm, please describe main business activity and number of employees; if another organisation, please describe your organisation's purpose, functions and membership size.

If you are making this submission as an individual, please briefly indicate your interest in the occupation your submission relates to.

The NZPPTA is the professional and industrial organisation representing 18,000 secondary teachers and principals in secondary, composite and intermediate state and state integrated schools.

2. What occupation does this submission refer to?

Occupation job title and ANZSCO code

Please give the job title and 6-digit ANZSCO code (refer to the relevant PIER).

Secondary School Teacher (241411)

**Review of Essential Skills in Demand Lists
Submission Form**

3. What ESID list status do you think this occupation should have?

3a) What ESID list status do you propose this occupation should have?

- | | |
|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Retain on the ISSL | <input type="checkbox"/> Retain on the LTSSL |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Add to the ISSL | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Add to the LTSSL |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Remove from the ISSL | <input type="checkbox"/> Remove from the LTSSL |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Transfer from ISSL to LTSSL | <input type="checkbox"/> Transfer from LTSSL to ISSL |

3b) Does your proposal relate to the whole of New Zealand or only some regions? (ISSL only)

Please tick all that apply:

- Certain regions only:**
- Auckland/Upper North Island
 - Waikato/Bay of Plenty
 - Central North Island (including Taranaki, Manawatu and Hawkes Bay)
 - Wellington (including Wairarapa)
 - Canterbury/Upper South Island (including Westland)
 - Otago/Southland

OR

- All of New Zealand**

3c) Give your reasons for the proposed change to the ESID lists

Please summarise the major reasons for your proposal.

Note: If you have already provided an Occupation Nomination to the Ministry, you may wish to copy the information provided in response to Question 4(b) on the Occupation Nomination form.

Secondary and composite schools are unable to fill vacancies or find suitably qualified appointments.

The current shortage of secondary teachers will be compounded over the foreseeable future by declining teacher graduate numbers, increasing numbers of retirements/resignations from full time positions and rising school rolls.

4. Information and data relevant to the review

We would particularly like to receive information that provides more detail in relation to the indicators reported in the PIER. **Please refer to the relevant PIER when completing this section.**

It is important that the information that you provide is as specific and robust as possible. Please provide details about the source of your information, how many employers or individuals it represents, and when the information was obtained.

As a general guide, the Ministry is looking for evidence that has a **reasonable breadth of coverage** across the industry (i.e. represents the views or situation of a reasonable proportion of employers and/or employees and/or trainers or other stakeholders); and is **specific** (i.e. clearly stated facts in relation to the

**Review of Essential Skills in Demand Lists
Submission Form**

occupation). Independent industry surveys prepared by reputable agencies are usually the most compelling evidence.

Evidence should be **able to be substantiated** in some way, for example sourced to a survey, administrative data, or employer/employee feedback.

Information that does not meet these standards may not be sufficient to support your submission.

Additional material may be attached in a separate document, if necessary. Where you are appending detailed reports or other information please cite these under the relevant headings below.

4a) Skill level

Please note any comments that you wish to make on the skill section of the relevant PIER.

Overseas applicants should have an initial teacher education qualification recognised by the teaching Council of NZ and a subject specialty equivalent to level 7 on the NZ curriculum framework (degree equivalent) which may be a concurrent or separate qualification.

4b) Scale

Please provide any information that may be relevant concerning the 'scale' of the occupation. This could include information on the total number of people employed in this occupation in New Zealand, and the number of work visas your organisation or its members have sought in the last year.

Please note any other comments that you wish to make on the scale section of the relevant PIER.

There are about 22,000 regular teachers in the secondary teaching force and several thousand day relievers.

4c) Shortage

Please refer to the shortage section of the relevant PIER. We are interested in your response to the information provided, as well as any additional information (such as industry surveys and reports) you can provide.

*Describe and provide any additional **evidence** you have on the question of shortage.*

*For example, if you consider that **there is an occupational shortage**:*

- *evidence of difficulties employers are having recruiting staff (depending on the occupation, difficulty for a single employer is unlikely to be sufficient)*
- *estimated apprentice or graduate trainee numbers and the number of workers leaving or retiring from the industry, and reasons for leaving*
- *forecasts and reports on the growth of the occupation/industry.*

*Alternatively, if you consider that **there is not an occupational shortage**:*

- *evidence of suitably trained people available (or soon to be available) to work in the occupation*
- *forecasts and reports on the growth of the occupation/industry.*

The Ministry of Education has just released projections for teacher supply and demand over coming years. These projections are conservative, in our view, based on the reasons described below. One of the reasons is that they assumed balance supply and demand in 2017, which we contest. Despite this the projection shows a gap between demand and supply of secondary teachers of over 2200 teacher by 2025, based on current policy settings. This is an average of more than five teachers per secondary school. These projections are available here:

**Review of Essential Skills in Demand Lists
Submission Form**

<https://www.educationcounts.gov.nz/publications/series/he-whakaaro/a-summary-of-the-teacher-demand-and-supply-planning-tool>

PPTA and the secondary principals' organisations have undertaken sector-wide surveys of secondary principals who are reporting:

- positions that have remained unfilled after repeated advertising
- positions that have had to be filled by appointees who lacked the required subject qualifications or who otherwise would not normally have been considered suitable for appointment.

At the end of the 2017 year secondary schools were indicating a shortfall of around 1250 secondary teachers.

<http://www.nzspc.org.nz/nzspc-resources/300-nzspc-spanz-survey-of-principals-on-secondary-teacher-supply-2017>

While we are still gathering the equivalent data for this year, the indications are that the number of such gaps is higher. These shortages are found across subjects and across the country, though they are more concentrated in some areas and in some subjects than others.

Evidence available to us from our annual survey indicates that the day relief pool has been heavily depleted to fill gaps in full time positions.

<https://www.ppta.org.nz/assets/Uploads/2018-Secondary-Staffing-Survey-report.pdf>

A smaller scale survey of secondary schools indicates that many are currently relying on deferred retirements to avoid greater shortfalls in filled positions.

Nationally available data on ITE graduates shows that the number of new secondary teacher education graduates has dropped by more than a third in recent years and this shows no sign of recovering in the immediate term.

Applications for teaching jobs (as measured in PPTA's annual survey of secondary and composite schools) are at the lowest level since the survey began in 1996. Secondary schools face growing rolls (and therefore increased need for secondary teachers) to 2025.

A joint report by PPTA, the Ministry of Education and the Schools Trustees Association on the secondary teacher supply situation in 2016 can be found here:

<https://education.govt.nz/assets/Uploads/Secondary-Teacher-Supply-Working-Group-Report-9-August-2016.pdf>

The report (pp5-6) summarises the situation in 2016:

- The workforce is ageing. 45.4% of secondary teachers are over 50 years of age.
- Fewer beginning teachers are entering the profession, and the proportion that start in permanent full time positions has also fallen.
- There is a high rate of attrition among beginning secondary teachers. Just under half leave teaching within the first five years of joining the profession.
- There are not enough new teachers in science, technology and mathematics to meet demand.
- Teacher vacancies are increasing. Following the ten year low during the global financial crisis, job advertisements are rising, and we expect this trend to continue in the short to medium term.

Review of Essential Skills in Demand Lists Submission Form

- Teacher shortages create pressure across the education pathway and impact on student achievement. Employers report that they are forced to compromise on quality to fill positions.
- Supply and demand issues are nuanced, differ by school and location, and are being experienced across deciles. There is a concentration of issues in Auckland, but also in some regions and rural areas particularly in sciences, technology and maths (STM) subjects and Te Reo Māori.

The supply situation across NZ has deteriorated in the two years since the report was produced.

We note that MBEI's PIERS for secondary teachers says that evidence for demand is weak, but bases this on the Jobs Online index. Secondary teaching jobs are mostly advertised in the Education Gazette and few schools use other forms of advertising.

5. Other factors relevant to determining whether a change to the ESID lists is appropriate

In addition to the evidence of shortage, an important aspect of the review process is to consider whether there are other factors that make it appropriate to add or remove an occupation from the lists. These factors may not be included in the PIER assessment, partly because the range of potential factors is broad, and often robust quantitative measures are not nationally available.

However, those directly involved in an occupation or industry often hold valuable quantitative and qualitative information relevant to the decision-making process. It is therefore important that you provide appropriate information in the following three areas: Labour market conditions, Training and industry initiatives and Wider economic factors.

Please provide specific details and the source of your information (e.g. independent report, survey, study, administrative data, collated feedback).

5a) Labour market conditions

The Ministry must be satisfied that the industry has a commitment to the provisions of New Zealand employment legislation available to workers. It is important that the hiring of overseas workers is not being used as a strategy to keep wages or terms and conditions of employment to a minimum.

*i. Provide information on **wage ranges** applicable to this occupation*

Entry salary for a trained and qualified beginning teacher is currently \$51,200.

Top of basic scale salary (TBS) for a classroom teacher is \$78,000.

Salary relative to other NZ wage and salary has been steadily declining (from a TBS of 1.75 times the median wage in 1998 to 1.47 times the median wage currently).

The decline in relative wage has had a marked impact on recruitment and retention.

*ii. Provide brief information on **terms and conditions of employment** applicable to this occupation (e.g. working hours, employee benefits)*

Workloads are considered to be high in secondary teaching and the work is complex and demanding.

A working party report from NZPPTA, Ministry of Education, Education Council of New Zealand and School Trustees can be found here:

<https://www.ppta.org.nz/dmsdocument/479>

It summarises:

**Review of Essential Skills in Demand Lists
Submission Form**

- Many teachers are passionate about their work but for some, the workload burden is becoming unmanageable.
- Workload can impact on teacher satisfaction, retention and wellbeing with a flow-on effect to student learning and wellbeing.
- If workload is high, teachers are more likely to be dissatisfied with their job, consider leaving the profession and have a poor work-life balance. This issue particularly impacts on teachers and middle managers.

A PPTA report, based in part on a survey of 1300 teachers and daily activity records of 200 teachers can be found here:

<https://www.ppta.org.nz/dmsdocument/133>

Classroom teachers were working an average of 52.4 hours per week in 2015 and middle leaders in schools were working an average of 55.6 hours per week.

Employee benefits (other than salary and employer contributions to Kiwisaver are largely limited to intrinsic factors (e.g. the satisfaction of working with young adults).

iii. You may also wish to provide information on the following, if relevant:

- *information on trends in work hours in response to growing shortages*
- *the breadth and scale of shortage, and whether some regions are facing shortages, while others are not (and why this is the case)*
- *whether there are barriers such as transport, childcare, or work hours, which employers could address to make working in the occupation more attractive to suitably skilled people?*

A recent PPTA survey of members indicates that half have had to cover additional classes because of the inability of schools to find day relief teachers.

The national shortage of secondary teachers is compounded in some urban areas by the high cost of accommodation. This is a significant contributor to the higher levels of shortage in Auckland, but also affects cities such as Wellington and areas like Queenstown Lakes.

The key drivers of secondary teacher shortages are low relative wages, high and increasingly complex workloads and the high accommodation costs in major urban areas.

5b) Training and industry initiatives

The Ministry **must** be satisfied that the industry has a commitment to fully utilising the domestic labour market before the industry considers employing overseas workers.

Your submission **must** include information on the following:

- demonstrated industry commitment to training, and
- industry initiatives to enhance domestic recruitment.

i. What steps are being taken by the industry and employers to address this shortage? In the short-term? In the long-term?

This may include data on trends in firm/industry investments in training, information on trainee numbers and people who are currently nearing completion of qualifications.

There are a number of initial teacher education providers around the country. Generally post graduate students pay for their own initial teacher education.

**Review of Essential Skills in Demand Lists
Submission Form**

The Ministry of Education is running an advertising campaign and offering scholarships for people wishing to train or retrain as teachers and support for overseas teachers wishing to return or migrate to work in NZ. They are funding a fixed number of people for the cost of a short term refresher course for teachers who have never been fully certificated to allow them to return to teaching or relieving.

It has been made easier for schools to employ untrained teachers on limited authorities to teach.

There are some efforts being made to find no-cost/within policy steps that can be taken to reduce teacher workloads. The Ministry of Education has declined to fund workload reductions, accommodation support, guaranteed professional development or controls over excessive work hours.

Some individual schools with access to significant local funding are offering accommodation support to new employees.

ii. What strategies are in place to recruit New Zealanders?

Include examples of training and industry initiatives.

From: <https://www.education.govt.nz/news/new-initiatives-to-recruit-teachers/>

- The introduction of a National Beginner Teacher Project so schools can access up to 230 grants of \$10,000 each, to assist with mentoring and on-the-job training for graduate teachers. This will be targeted where there are shortages of teachers in some subjects and locations.
- Changes to the criteria to enable more schools to access the 3R National Fund - making it easier to recruit for staff in shortage subject and isolated areas.
- Further support for teachers required to repeat or re-sit aspects of the Teacher Education Refresh programme - at no further cost. More availability of a finder's fee of up to \$3000 per teacher to help schools offset recruitment costs.
- Increasing the number of Overseas Relocation Grants to match the expanded recruitment drive – for returning Kiwi teachers and overseas-trained teachers. Additional funding for agencies to process more overseas teacher applications.
- Expanding the Teacher Education Refresh (TER) subsidy so it can be accessed by overseas teachers who require it to meet certification requirements with the Teaching Council.
- Work with the Teaching Council to improve PLD support available for overseas-trained teachers – including a focus on induction that builds the culturally responsive practices needed to work in New Zealand.

iii. Does your industry have an agreed skills plan? (i.e. a plan for upskilling the current workforce and/or potential workforce)?

No, but the Ministry of Education is working to develop one.

If yes, describe the expected outcomes of the plan (or attach a copy).

- *What are the **goals** of the plan?*
- *What **processes** are in place to achieve the goals?*
- *What are the **timeframes** for the goals?*

**Review of Essential Skills in Demand Lists
Submission Form**

*If your industry does not have an agreed skills plan, what plans are in place to develop one?
Within what timeframe?*

Yes –see attachment

5c) Wider economic factors

Wider economic factors may have an influence on occupational shortages. Is there anything else that you would like to comment on?

For example, are there reasons associated with productivity, innovation or competitiveness that you think the Ministry should take into consideration? Please provide evidence.

The social and economic health of the country is dependent upon an effective education sector. This in turn relies upon students having continued access through their schooling to properly trained and qualified teachers.

Even the Ministry of Education projections (which PPTA and other sector groups believe are significantly underestimating the problem) would indicate that the average secondary school would be running about 6 or 7 teachers short (or about 10% understaffed) for a period that would cover two generations of secondary students. In addition to the actual gaps many more positions would be filled by compromise with teachers who lack the required subject qualifications.

The Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment would like to thank you for contributing to the review.